

**PROMOTION CRITERIA MATRIX  
UNIVERSITY OF VERMONT LARNER COLLEGE OF MEDICINE**

NOTE: The following is intended to present examples only of various levels of accomplishment in the areas of teaching, research, clinical activity, scholarship and service. It is not exclusionary, but is intended to assist faculty, department chairs and promotion committees in matching candidates' accomplishments to the promotion criteria. Moreover, areas frequently overlap in practice, although they are presented as distinct entities here. It should also be noted that the matrix specifies just two categories, expectations and excellence. Professors will need to achieve excellence by a number of criteria. Associate Professors will have met fewer of these criteria or in not as great depth. The promotion process is meant to describe and reward continued professional growth and achievement.

<b>TEACHING</b>	
<u>Expectation</u>	<u>Excellence</u>
Active participation in teaching activities of the department, college or university, including two or more of the following: presenting lectures covering one or more topics; coordinating a course; acting as a primary instructor in a course; advising or mentoring students, residents or faculty; attending on an inpatient or outpatient service; organizing or facilitating a seminar series, journal clubs or laboratory exercises; participating as a teacher in continuing education activities.	Regularly assumes greater than average share of teaching duties –in classroom, laboratory, clinical or community settings.
Meritorious teaching evaluations from students and peers.	Consistently receives outstanding teaching evaluations or teaching awards.
Development or redevelopment of teaching materials for students, continuing education courses or other faculty training.	Recognition as an outstanding and influential role model for students, fellows, residents or other trainees.
Self-improvement activities (for example, participation in workshops or courses that are designed to improve teaching or mentoring effectiveness).	Record of successful mentorship of students, residents, fellows or other faculty, as measured by: letters of support from mentees; publications, presentations, grants, awards or other evidence of mentees' academic success; evidence that mentees have pursued outstanding careers. Invitations to present Grand Rounds or seminars at other institutions; invitations to present lectures or courses outside of primary department.
Participation as a mentor on a training grant or teaching academy.	Development of impactful mentoring programs that focus on career development or academic promotion of students, residents, fellows or faculty.
Invitations to speak at local seminars, grand rounds, conferences, etc.	Development of innovative teaching methods, such as educational websites, simulations, videotapes, on-line courses or workshops.

<b>TEACHING (continued)</b>	
Occasional book chapter or review.	Successful leadership of local, regional or national continuing education courses or similar.
	Consistent participation in national educational activities (for example, residency review committees, programs sponsored by professional organizations, re-certification courses or workshops).
	Invitations to be a visiting professor at other institutions.
	Development of innovative courses, high-quality syllabi, novel lectures, problem-based learning cases, laboratory exercises or other instructional materials.
	Demonstration of educational leadership (for example, by serving as a course, fellowship or training program director or associate dean).
	Evidence of teaching scholarship (for example, research, grants, publications or national presentations that focus on understanding the best methods, or outcomes, of teaching).
	Completion of advanced faculty development programs that result in a certificate or degree in education, with evidence that the faculty member has applied these new skills or new knowledge to improve his or her teaching or pedagogy.
	Author of a series of books, reviews and similar scholarly works that are educational in nature or purpose.

<b>RESEARCH</b>	
<b><u>Expectation</u></b>	<b><u>Excellence</u></b>
Authorship of papers in peer-reviewed journals that demonstrate the ability to generate and test hypotheses and represent a significant contribution to the published literature.	A consistent level of peer-reviewed or other funding for research awarded in a competitive manner over a sustained period of time.
Co-investigator status on grants.	Demonstrated evidence of originality as an investigator.
A principal and sustained role in the management of a research program with external funding.	Demonstration of significant independent intellectual contributions to successful research programs.
Development of patents or discoveries.	Principal investigator status on competitive peer reviewed research grants (for example: R03 or R21 awards or mentored K08 or K23 awards from NIH or private foundations for associate professors; R01, P01 or other independent awards for professors).
Presentations at national meetings; invited research seminars at this and other institutions; service as an ad hoc member on study sections.	Development of a significant number of licenses and patents.
	An ongoing, peer-reviewed publication record with first- or senior-author publications.
	A national or international reputation, as evidenced by: arm's length external letters of reference; invitations to present at national or international meetings; invitations to write authoritative reviews or chapters, or to provide unique expertise as a collaborator on a research project; visiting professorships; service on as a regular member on study sections; chair of study sections; membership on internal or external scientific advisory panels or committees; leadership of national meetings; service as a national consultant or on editorial boards of journals.

<b>SERVICE: GENERAL</b>	
<b><u>Expectation</u></b>	<b><u>Excellence</u></b>
Service on committees or task forces within the program, division, department, school or university.	Regularly assumes greater than average share of administrative responsibilities including service to college, university, professional discipline or community.
Service to local, state, national or international organizations through education, consultation or other roles.	Appointment to leadership positions within the institution such as: chair of a committee; faculty officer; program director; academic clinical coordinator; membership on major decision-making College of Medicine committees.
Service as a manuscript reviewer for clinical, educational or scientific journals,	Service as an officer or committee chair in professional or scientific organizations.
	Service as a member or chair of a scientific study section or service as an editor or an editorial board member on professional or scientific journals.
	Appointment to leadership positions dealing with health care or educational issues at the local, state, regional, national or international levels.
	Service awards from the University or from a local, national, or international organization (civic, scientific or professional).
	Significant involvement in health care advocacy, community service or outreach, community based participatory research programs or other similar activities that shape public policy on healthcare or that address health disparities.
	Leadership of activities or programs that address challenges in education, training of scientists, assessment of competency or learning outcomes, mentorship, professionalism or education.

<b>SERVICE: CLINICAL ACTIVITY - (if applicable)</b>	
<b><u>Expectation</u></b>	<b><u>Excellence</u></b>
Invitations to speak on clinical topics on campus, or participation on institutional clinical care committees.	Creative, active participation and leadership in the evaluation of the effectiveness of care (quality, outcomes, patient safety, utilization, access, cost).
Demonstration of clinical skills that are highly effective (e.g., mastery of important clinical techniques, high degree of patient satisfaction, evidence of high quality and efficient patient care).	Continuing, significant participation for an extended period of time in clinical activities that are highly effective – “the go to person”.
Support from peers at the site of practice.	Development of new and innovative techniques, therapies, clinical guidelines, patient care practices or health care delivery systems that have improved the health of patients or populations.
Active and effective participation in the clinical activities of the academic unit.	Regularly assumes greater than average share of clinical duties, as measured by patient care or procedure logs, clinical statistics or other measures of clinical effort. Ideally, with dissemination of knowledge gained from the clinical work.
Board certification or recertification.	Participation in significant self-assessment activities and audits of one’s own practice that have led to improvements in quality, efficiency or outcomes of care.
Active participation in activities that promote health care quality and patient safety.	Recognition for excellence in clinical activity at the local, regional, national or international level as evidenced by letters of reference, honors, awards, institutional evaluations, membership in practice guideline efforts, invitations to speak or requests to write reviews.
Completion of self-improvement activities (for example, participation in workshops or continuing medical education activities that are designed to improve knowledge or clinical skills).	Demonstration of effective leadership at the site of clinical practice – e.g., director of a clinical service, head of a division, chair of a department, head of an interdisciplinary team that creates and manages a clinical pathway and evidenced by objective outcomes evaluation.
	Assumption of a substantive leadership role at the regional level – e.g., chairing committees, or serving as officer of local or statewide professional organizations
	Leadership of structured activities that promote quality of care and patient safety and that advance the science and practice of health care quality improvement as exemplified by publications, reviews, etc. on this topic.

**SERVICE: CLINICAL ACTIVITY (continued)**

Significant involvement in health care advocacy, community service or other activities that shape public policy on health care delivery or that address health disparities.

Evidence of health care-related scholarship (for example, grants, publications, authoritative review articles, national presentations, innovations or other activities that advance the science and practice of health care quality improvement).

This section of the Promotion Matrix presents examples of the scholarship of discovery, teaching, integration and application. The Matrix specifies only two categories (“engaged” and “excellent”). The line between “engaged” and “excellent” scholarship may not be easy to define; however, excellence in scholarship is intended here to signify a higher level of accomplishment and implies that the work meets one or more of the following tests: *Recognition*: the work is recognized as excellent by peers; *Impact and importance*: it has contributed to an improved understanding of the discipline; *Coherence*: the publications, innovative curricula or other scholarly products represent a coherent body of work; and *Creative Leadership*: There is evidence of creativity and leadership by the faculty member. There may be considerable overlap between scholarship and other areas of faculty accomplishment (teaching, clinical activity and service). There is an expectation of scholarship for all COM faculty pathways as outlined in the COM Standards and Guidelines and COM Faculty Handbook.

### SCHOLARSHIP OF DISCOVERY

**The “scholarship of discovery” refers to traditional, hypothesis-driven research that results in the generation of new knowledge. Impactful “discovery scholarship” results in peer-reviewed scientific publications.**

<u>Engaged</u>	<u>Excellent</u>
Serves as a collaborator in a basic science, clinical, translational, educational or other research program.	Designs and directs a basic science, clinical, translational or other research program and plays a major role in writing up the results.
Authorship of peer-reviewed journals that demonstrate the ability to generate and test hypotheses and represent a significant contribution to the published literature. Coauthorship of similar manuscripts that demonstrate significant contribution and ability to work in collaborative team.	Has an ongoing record of first- or senior-author publications in peer-reviewed journals that: a) represent significant contributions to the published literature; b) demonstrate the ability to generate and test hypotheses; and c) demonstrate originality and independence as an investigator or represent significant independent intellectual contributions to successful team-based research programs.
Co-investigator status on grants	A consistent level of peer-reviewed or other funding for research awarded in a competitive manner over a sustained period of time.
A principal and sustained role in the management of a research program with external funding.	Principal investigator status on competitive peer-reviewed research grants (for example: R03 or R21 awards or mentored K08 or K23 awards from NIH or private foundations for associate professors; R01, P01 or other independent awards for professors).
Development of patents and copyrights.	Development of a significant number of patents or commercialization of patents.
Service as an ad hoc reviewer or member of an editorial board for a medical or scientific journal.	Service as an editor, associate editor or section editor for a medical or scientific journal
Ad hoc grant review	Service as a regular member on scientific study sections.

\*El Boyer Scholarship Reconsidered-Priorities for the Professorate, Carnegie Foundation, 1990

**SCHOLARSHIP OF APPLICATION**

The “scholarship of application” includes activities that build bridges between theory and practice or that apply knowledge to practical problems. Examples include development of new medical treatment modalities, clinical care pathways, or other activities that address community health care needs, that shape public policy on health care or that that promote quality of care delivery and patient safety and advance the science and practice of health care quality improvement.

<b><u>Engaged</u></b>	<b><u>Excellent</u></b>
Active participation in activities that promote health care quality, cost-efficiency, access or patient safety within the institution (Provide documentation of interventions and outcomes).	Leadership of projects that have improved the quality of care, cost-efficiency, access, or patient safety locally, nationally or internationally (Provides documentation of interventions and outcomes).
Co-authorship of articles, policy reports or other publications related to clinical or health services topics.	A record of multiple publications related to clinical or health services topics, which may include clinical trials, investigative reports, case studies, policy reports or other publications that have advanced the science and practice of health care delivery and quality improvement.
	Articles, white papers or other products of scholarship that focus on health care advocacy, community service or other activities that shape public policy on health care or that address health disparities.
	Other evidence of clinical scholarship (for example, research, authoritative review articles, grants, contributions to clinical information systems, publications or national presentations) that promote health care quality, health care delivery or patient safety or that advance the science and practice of health care quality improvement.
	Development of new techniques, therapies, clinical guidelines, patient care practices or health care delivery systems that have improved the health of patients or populations.



### SCHOLARSHIP OF INTEGRATION

The “scholarship of integration” (horizontal scholarship) includes creative synthesis or analyses that define “connections across disciplines” or bring new insights to bear on original research. The scholarship of integration seeks to interpret, analyze and draw together the results of the original research. Review articles and book chapters are examples of the scholarship of integration.

<u>Engaged</u>	<u>Excellent</u>
Co-authorship of articles integrating knowledge in a field and assessing overall value of discoveries in relationship patient care, teaching or other areas.	Consistent record of senior-author review or other scholarly products; these reviews or other integrative works represent a major body of scholarship that also provides a demonstrable national or international reputation.
Publication of review articles, book chapters, case series or other reports that integrate knowledge and put new discoveries into perspective.	

### SCHOLARSHIP OF TEACHING

The “scholarship of teaching” focuses on the development of new teaching methods, assessments of learning outcomes and preparation and dissemination of highly effective curricula or other instructional materials.

<u>Engaged</u>	<u>Excellent</u>
Improvement or expansion of an existing course or curriculum.	Development of innovative courses, high-quality syllabi, novel lectures, problem-based learning cases, laboratory exercises or other instructional materials.
Adaptation of a curriculum from elsewhere into an effective learning experience for learners.	Development of original and/or innovative teaching methods, such as educational websites, simulations, videotapes, packaged courses or workshops, etc.
Constant improvement and enhancement of an impactful and engaged learning experience.	A strong record of first- or senior-author publications in health professions education.
Novel, original presentations on teaching.	Other evidence of teaching scholarship (for example, research, grants or national presentations that focus on understanding the best methods, or outcomes, of teaching).